



# PLAN FOR ACCELERATING TRANSFORMATIVE HOUSING (PATH) INNOVATIONS COMMITTEE MEETING

## MINUTES

**DATE:** Thursday, August 17th, 2023, 9:00 am – 11:00 am

**RECORDING OF MEETING:**

<https://us02web.zoom.us/rec/share/vvUXpUTeQw-Et13hQDe59UwdE6i9dqDghUh5bmEjCbQ-00lsmi52LclgJbd8BR7Z.yuEL463-S4GgOH0Z>

**PASSCODE:**

K%1f=G.g

Time	Agenda Item	Presenter/Facilitator
9:00	<b>Welcome and Introductions</b>	- <i>Matt Mitchell, Focus Strategies</i>
	<b>Hybrid Meeting Norms</b>	- <i>Matt Mitchell, Focus Strategies</i>
	<b>Review and Approval of Minutes</b>	- <i>Matt Mitchell, Focus Strategies</i>
	<b>Public Comment</b> – Open Period for public comment on items discussed or not listed on the agenda.	- <i>Members of the public</i>
9:20	<b>Unsheltered Data Dashboard Review</b> – Quarterly review of unsheltered metrics	- <i>Dana Ewing, H3</i>
9:40	<b>Data Deep Dive</b> – Discussion of outcomes data from the 2023 Annual Report	- <i>Dana Ewing, H3</i>
10:00	<b>Accomplishments and Looking Ahead</b> – Update on opportunities identified in by the Committee in August 2022	- <i>Shelby Ferguson, H3</i>
10:20	<b>Stakeholder Spotlight: City of Antioch</b> – Presentation on city-level homelessness prevention efforts	- <i>Teri House, City of Antioch</i>
10:40	<b>Announcements</b>	- <i>All</i>
10:45	<b>Next Steps</b>	- <i>Matt Mitchell, Focus Strategies</i>



# PLAN FOR ACCELERATING TRANSFORMATIVE HOUSING (PATH) INNOVATIONS COMMITTEE MEETING

## **Welcome and Introductions**

Committee Members in Attendance: Deanne Pearn (virtual), Juno Hedrick (virtual), Iman Novin, Shawn Ray, Teri House, Tony Ucciferri, Wayne Earl

Staff and Consultants: Dana Ewing (H3), Caroline Miller (H3), Shelby Ferguson (H3), Mary Fitzgerald (H3), Deborah Keenan (H3), Matt Mitchell (FS), Matt Lemon (FS)

Additional Attendees: Jo Bruno (Delta Peers), Stephanie Stovall (Contra Costa Health), Kalil Macklin (Anthem Blue Cross), Carl Mason (Hope Solutions)

## **Hybrid Meeting Norms**

Matt Mitchell described hybrid meetings norms including a recommendation to wear masks in person, practicing social distancing, raising your hand, saying your name before speaking and maintaining a safe and respectful environment. Individuals who behave in a manner that threatens the safety of the group or that does not honor meeting norms may be asked to leave.

## **Review and Approval of Minutes**

Teri House made a motion to approve the minutes from July 20, 2023. Wayne Earl seconded the motion. There was no discussion. The motion passed unanimously.

## **Public Comment**

No public comment was offered.

## **Unsheltered Data Dashboard Review**

Dana Ewing presented results from the Unsheltered Data Dashboard for the January 2023 through March 2023 reporting period. She presented data on the number of households experiencing unsheltered homelessness during the quarter and the number active at the end of the quarter; the number of households moving from unsheltered homelessness to permanent housing and to shelter; the average length of time households were unsheltered and in shelter; the number of households moving from shelter to permanent housing; the number of households moving from shelter and housing to unsheltered status; and the number of households experiencing unsheltered homelessness for the first time.

Shelby Ferguson asked how many of the 132 households who moved from housing to unsheltered status came from programs compared to how many came from market rate or other housing in the community. Dana Ewing noted that they could look at the data, but that very few were from programs.

Dana Ewing reviewed the demographics of unsheltered households. She noted that these measures stay relatively consistent across reporting periods. The proportion of households by race ranged from 2 percent for Native Hawaiian/Other Pacific Islander and Asian American/Asian households to 46% for



## PLAN FOR ACCELERATING TRANSFORMATIVE HOUSING (PATH) INNOVATIONS COMMITTEE MEETING

white households. About 20% of households were Hispanic/Latinx and 86% of households had at least one disabling condition.

Dana Ewing reviewed the percentage of unsheltered households with exits to shelter or permanent housing by race and ethnicity. The data showed the rates were lowest for Asian American/Asian households and highest for multiple race households. Deanne Pearn asked what the rates were showing. Dana Ewing stated that the rates were the percentage within each category with an exit to shelter or permanent housing and not the proportion of total exits.

Dana Ewing reviewed the average number of days unsheltered prior to entering shelter by race and ethnicity. The average number of days was lowest for Native American/Alaska Native/Indigenous households and longest for Asian American/Asian households, though Dana Ewing thought the long length of time for Asian American/Asian households maybe skewed because relatively few households were served.

Dana Ewing reviewed takeaways from the data including the low percentage of exits from unsheltered to shelter or permanent housing; the low percentage of households newly unsheltered; the low percentage of sheltered households exiting to housing; the wide range in number of days unsheltered; and the range in percentage of exits to permanent housing or shelter by race and ethnicity.

Dana Ewing reviewed changes compared to the previous quarter. She noted that there was only a difference of two people active at the end of the quarter compared to the prior quarter; an increase in the total number served; an increase of 63% (34 people) in the number of households exiting to permanent housing; and an increase of about 70 people moving from shelter or permanent housing to unsheltered status, among other changes. Dana Ewing stated that the number in each category can make a large impact on the percent change.

Iman Novin asked why there are more exits from shelter to permanent housing than from unsheltered to permanent housing. Dana Ewing stated that programs serving unsheltered households, including outreach and care centers, are designed to connect people to shelter and thus the number will be higher than the number that go directly to permanent housing. Shelby Ferguson noted that people in shelter have access to different levels and types of case management as well.

Iman Novin asked why the data show that more people are entering into unsheltered homelessness than exiting. Dana Ewing noted that those figures could benefit from additional context as the number who are unsheltered is not as large as those in housing. Teri House asked if the data reflects diversion efforts. Shelby Ferguson noted that Rapid Exit from shelter would be captured in this data. Deanne Pearn noted that the 289 people entering unsheltered status highlights the need for prevention work since these are folks who are losing their housing.

Dana Ewing reviewed takeaways about the changes from the previous quarter. Overall positives included an increase in the number of exits from unsheltered to shelter and to housing; a decrease in



## PLAN FOR ACCELERATING TRANSFORMATIVE HOUSING (PATH) INNOVATIONS COMMITTEE MEETING

the length of time unsheltered prior to shelter or housing; and a decrease in the length of time sheltered prior to housing. Areas for improvement included the number actively being served at the end of the reporting period, the increase in the total number served, the increase in the number becoming unsheltered from shelter or housing, and the increase in the number newly experiencing unsheltered homelessness.

Wayne Earl asked about the time period captured and noted that some abatement efforts may have impacted the numbers. He noted that some people may have gone into temporary housing that is not shelter and other people may have gotten into navigation programs. Dana Ewing stated that some of the data points could reflect that impact, though it would be a small proportion of the overall number served. Shelby Ferguson and Dana Ewing noted that the data only shows households who entered HMIS and were unsheltered prior to entry.

Deanne Pearn stated that the data show more flow in the system with people moving through the system faster. She noted that one of the tools they had was Emergency Housing Vouchers and that they had just reached 200 households moved into housing. She stated it would be helpful to see what type of permanent housing people were exiting to. Dana Ewing noted that they do have the data, though it was not shown in this presentation.

Shawn Ray stated that it would be helpful to be able to track what happens to people after cleanup efforts to see how many took up services and noted this would help to better tailor those services. Dana Ewing noted that H3 is talking about targeting services for different populations and provided an example of families taking up services at potentially higher rates. Shawn Ray noted that they are tracking their own data for their homeless outreach efforts now and stated it was amazing to see how many conversations officers were having with people and how much they got to know about them. Tony Ucciferri and Dana Ewing asked what the department is doing with the data and whether there are summaries available. Shawn Ray stated that data collection started last September and is progressing as people build trust. He noted that the data is internal for now but that there have been conversations about making it more accessible and provided an example of how many people are impacted during cleanup activities around railroads.

### **Data Deep Dive - Annual Report**

Dana Ewing presented information from the 2022 Annual Report that includes data describing the population served, analyzes issues related to equity, and talks about housing opportunities and partnerships. She reviewed data comparing 2022 to 2019 that showed an increase in the number of households in HMIS and in the PIT count, as well as some changes in the types of households served. She also reviewed data from 2022 on the types of programs used; race and ethnicity; age groups; and disabling conditions.

Dana Ewing reviewed data on exits to permanent housing overall and by subpopulation. Overall exits to permanent housing were 90% from Prevention and 21% from crisis response. For exits to permanent



## PLAN FOR ACCELERATING TRANSFORMATIVE HOUSING (PATH) INNOVATIONS COMMITTEE MEETING

housing by race and ethnicity, Black/African American/African households had the highest rate from crisis response while Native Hawaiian/Other Pacific Islander households had the highest rates from Prevention. American Indian/Alaska Native/Indigenous households had the lowest rates for both types of services. For other populations, veterans had the highest exit rates from crisis response while LGBTQIA+ and chronically homeless households had the lowest. Dana Ewing noted that they saw some improvement in veterans a while ago due to work with Built for Zero, but that rates had now stabilized. She also noted that the data show some disparities that should be considered. She also noted that the LGBTQIA+ population tends to be younger and has more missing data.

Iman Novin stated it would be helpful to look at how much funding was spent per person for each population type. Dana Ewing stated she was not sure how to get that data as they don't track spending in that particular way, but that they could look at programs geared toward specific populations. Shelby Ferguson noted that they could show some financial data from programs that track financial assistance within HMIS and could break that data down by race and ethnicity.

Dana Ewing reviewed data showing changes in positive exits from 2021 to 2022. The data showed higher percentages for Prevention/Diversion and crisis response and slightly lower rates for retention in permanent housing. She noted that the retention rate data needed to be examined more closely for accuracy. She stated that the higher exits rates may be related to a focus on case management and more housing vouchers.

The Committee discussed data that caught their attention and outcomes. Tony Ucciferri noted that one contributor to higher success rates may be an unprecedented amount of funding from HUD and from the State. He stated that this has led to more opportunities to provide rental subsidies than in the past and that the trend may continue for a short time but that there is buzz that the next couple of years may be leaner.

Tony Ucciferri also stated that we are still not building enough housing to truly succeed. Iman Novin noted that for every new unit added there are about three units of naturally occurring affordable housing lost. Dana Ewing noted that the StoryMap has some data related to housing.

The Committee discussed data that would be useful, including getting a higher-level perspective of progress relative to the Committee's goal around unsheltered homelessness and the resources and time that would be needed. Deanne Pearn noted it would be helpful to see what tools and supports are getting people housed, how to manage the question around people flowing into the system at higher rates, and the need to invest and build capacity.

Stephanie Stovall stated there is a need for financial literacy and job/education programming to break generational cycles. She also stated there is some abuse happening where people are in housing programs who may not need them and that there should be more frequent assessment of changes in income. She stated there should be a path out of housing programs in addition to a path in. Jo Bruno noted that SparkPoint has a good financial literacy program and could be a good partner for this work.



## PLAN FOR ACCELERATING TRANSFORMATIVE HOUSING (PATH) INNOVATIONS COMMITTEE MEETING

Shelby Ferguson discussed Moving On and noted that getting EHV vouchers helps give opportunities to people who no longer need services but still need subsidies. Tony Ucciferri noted the intent with some EHV vouchers was to support moving on, but the majority ended up going to people exiting shelters. He noted they have been talking with HUD about converting EHV into permanent vouchers. He also noted there are program rules around assets that can impact who receives services.

The Committee discussed the need for both services, including addiction services, more buildings, and operating subsidies. Iman Novin noted the need for subsidies given that even naturally occurring affordable housing in the area still has high rent. Mary Fitzgerald stated in the chat that housing inventory is a huge barrier to ending homelessness and that advocacy work around housing is critical. Jo Bruno asked if the CoC should start a committee or workgroup to discuss the issue. Wayne Earl noted that subsidies increase the cost of housing and that the challenge of working with people experiencing trauma who are scared of losing their housing should be taken into account.

### **Accomplishments and Looking Ahead**

Shelby Ferguson reviewed some accomplishments related to opportunities the Committee identified about one year ago. She noted that there has been an expansion of services in East County including expanded prevention and rapid rehousing through the Measure X RFP, as well as engaging with additional providers serving the area. She also noted that Measure X has helped with more equitable distribution of and access to resources.

Shelby Ferguson reviewed an increase in flexible funding including some funds from Measure X, HHAP, and HHIP. She noted that landlord engagement has increased through an expansion of some landlord incentives such as higher security deposits and that incentive funding through HHIP will continue to increase. She highlighted additional training for 211 and providers to help improve the referral process and noted that the number of Prevention programs will increase to 5 next year while the number of Rapid Exit programs will decline by one.

Shelby Ferguson noted that the Equity Committee has been working on improving messaging about available services including conducting some surveys and refining a Coordinated Entry flyer. She also noted that H3 staff meeting with providers to review HMIS data and that Committee review data on a quarterly basis, which has helped with change management.

### **Stakeholder Spotlight: City of Antioch**

Teri House presented information on funding to address homelessness in Antioch. She noted that committees like this don't often get the city-level perspective. She stated that Antioch is losing massive amounts of affordable housing and they are using a variety of funding sources to try and address the issue.



## PLAN FOR ACCELERATING TRANSFORMATIVE HOUSING (PATH) INNOVATIONS COMMITTEE MEETING

Teri House stated that there are two general categories, Permanent Housing and Prevention, based on the County's homelessness plan. She noted that the categories may not make sense anymore and that she would like to have conversations to see how they can be changed in the future.

Teri House reviewed programs for pathways to permanent housing funded through Housing Successor and PLHA dollars. The programs include CORE homeless outreach, emergency and family shelters, and a Safe Parking program. Funding for these programs for fiscal year 2023-24 is \$226,500. She also highlighted Opportunity Village, which is Antioch's first non-congregate Bridge to Housing program. The program is designed to potentially house up to 135 people per year and costs about \$2 million dollars annually.

Teri House reviewed programs for the prevention of homelessness that will receive about \$421,500 in fiscal year 2023-24. The programs include eviction prevention, Crisis/211 services, a food program (Nourishing Lives in Antioch), and a homelessness prevention program.

Teri House noted some new things coming to the city including efforts to increase tenant protections including rent stabilization and anti-harassment ordinances; hiring two FTEs for tenant/landlord work at the City to help with mediation and other services; free eviction legal assistance for low-income households; and a new RFP for a non-profit to conduct tenant outreach. She noted the approximate cost for staffing and outreach is around \$500,000.

Shelby Ferguson asked for recommendations on how to better work with other cities. Teri House noted that involving city officials on boards and committees can help them understand the scale and scope of the problem and that working with staff is important instead of jumping directly to city councils. Jo Bruno asked if putting together a document on best practices could be helpful and Teri House noted she could provide some information and thoughts. Teri House also noted it would be helpful to see more data on things like outreach contacts in different areas to help systematically analyze how each part of the County is served. Shelby Ferguson stated that some new CORE outreach teams over the next year should be helpful in getting more data.

### **Announcements**

No announcements were offered.

### **Next steps**

Matt Mitchell noted the Committee will be moving into reflecting on and creating priorities for next year in upcoming meetings. He stated that there will be a preview of goal setting for next year at the September meeting and then the Committee will discuss goals in more detail in October with the goal of solidifying a workplan in November. He also noted that the December meeting may be cancelled.

Teri House noted she will be transitioning off the Council on Homelessness and stated she would like to work on an inventory or database to better track the number of vouchers, newly created units, LIHTC



## PLAN FOR ACCELERATING TRANSFORMATIVE HOUSING (PATH) INNOVATIONS COMMITTEE MEETING

units, and similar resources to better illuminate the interconnectedness between the housing and homelessness systems.

**Meeting adjourned at 10:42 pm**